Less, Less, Less: The Beginning of the End of Coal

Prepared for
Institute for Energy Economics and Financial Analysis
and
New York University Institute for Policy Integrity

Michael W. Parker • Senior Analyst • +852-2918-5747 • michael.parker@bernstein.com
Flora Chang • Research Associate • +852-2918-5737 • flora.chang@bernstein.com

See Disclosure Appendix of this report for important Disclosures and Analyst Certifications
Asian Coal, Power and Renewables

Michael Parker is Vice President and Senior Research Analyst covering the Asian Coal, Power and Renewables sectors for Sanford C. Bernstein in Hong Kong. Prior to joining Bernstein, Michael was a Director of Corporate Development for renewable energy company, First Solar in New York where his responsibilities included managing corporate transactions and market forecasting. Michael previously worked for PricewaterhouseCoopers in San Francisco and in Wellington advising on various infrastructure projects and investments in both the telecom and power sector in the US and Asia-Pacific. Michael holds an MBA from New York University and a law degree and Bachelor of Commerce from the University of Otago, New Zealand. He is a barrister and solicitor of the High Court of New Zealand.

Contact Information

Michael Parker, Senior Analyst
Tel: +852 2918 5747
Fax: +852 2918 5757
E-mail: michael.parker@bernstein.com

Flora Chang, Senior Research Associate
Tel: +852 2918 5737
Fax: +852 2918 5757
E-mail: flora.chang@bernstein.com
Asian coal prices didn’t fall 25% over the course of 2012 because of the US and South Africa combining to export an incremental 11M tons of coal to a 4B ton Chinese coal market. Coal prices fell primarily because Chinese coal production and transportation capacity growth outstripped Chinese demand growth.
Chinese Power – Turn on the Lights, the Party’s Over

- China's "power multiplier" over the business cycle since 2007 is ~1x GDP growth. The power multiplier (power production growth divided by real GDP growth or the amount of electricity required by produce a unit of GDP) was 1.4x from 2003 to 2006, but falling.

![China: Power Production Share December 2012 – November 2013](image1)

![China: Power Intensity 1998-2013](image2)

Source: NBS, CEIC, Bernstein estimates and analysis

Source: NBS, CEIC, Bernstein estimates and analysis
Chinese Coal – No Diamonds, Plenty of Rough

- Coal prices have declined to RMB530/ton. Coal prices have fallen ~37% since November 2011 when the price touched RMB855/ton. **We are in the longest sustained period of price falling since at least 2006 and there are few signs that this trend is likely to change any time soon.**

Qinhuangdao 5,500kcal/kg Spot Coal Price – 2007-2014 current

Source: SX Coal, Bernstein analysis
Chinese Coal – No Diamonds, Plenty of Rough

- No insurmountable economies of scale. There are some economies of scale, but – in part as a result of the 2008 Shanxi industry consolidation - there are also multiple scaled operators.

- No lack of investment. Investment in the coal mining fixed assets in 2011 was up 30% Y/Y. And in 2010, coal mining fixed asset investment increased 24.8%. But in 2012, it was up just 8%, while in 2013, it decreased 0.4%.

![Chinese Coal Mining Fixed Asset Investment 2006 –2013](chart)

Source: CEIC, NBS, Bernstein analysis
Looking at a sample of 25 countries in terms of power intensity over the last ten years, at least five trends are clear.

Source: World Bank, IEA, Bernstein analysis
Coal-fired power stations account for roughly half of coal consumption in China. A slowdown in coal consumption by the power sector means that other coal-consuming sectors will need to step up their demand to satisfy new supply.

We cannot identify any other important coal consuming industries that are filling this gap.

---

**Chinese Coal Consumption by End Market, 2011**

- **Utilities**: 50.1%
- **Steel**: 18.7%
- **Chemicals**: 9.7%
- **Cement**: 7.3%
- **Other Manufacturing**: 6.7%
- **Residential**: 0.5%
- **Mining**: 7.6%
- **Other**: 1.7%
- **Agriculture**: 2.7%
- **Agriculture**: 2.7%

**Source**: NBS, CEIC, Bernstein Analysis, Media Reports

---

**Chinese Coal Consumption by End Market, 2012**

- **Power plants**: 93%
- **Coking**: 2%
- **Other**: 5%

**Source**: EIA, Bernstein Analysis and estimates
Chinese Coal – No Diamonds, Plenty of Rough

2017 Clean Air target by province announced by the Chinese Government State Council

BEIJING – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce 25% from 2012 level, specifically < 60ug/m3
- Coal consumption: cap at 10mt or a 13mt reduction; % of coal as energy reduce to <10%
- Retire 1,200 high polluting companies
- % of renewable energy increase to 15%
- Negative growth in coal consumption

INNER MONGOLIA – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 20% from 2012 level
- Retire 6.7mt of steel capacity and 18mt of coking capacity.
- % of renewable energy increase to 10%

SHANXI – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 20% from 2012 level
- Retire 6.7mt of steel capacity and 18mt of coking capacity.
- % of renewable energy increase to 10%

YANGTZE RIVER DELTA (Jiangsu, Zhejiang and Shanghai) – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 25% from 2012 level
- Retire 1,200 high polluting companies
- % of renewable energy increase to 15%
- Negative growth in coal consumption

SHANDONG – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 20% from 2012 level
- Retire 21mt of iron capacity and cap steel capacity at 50mt by 2015; and cap coke capacity at 40mt by 2017
- Coal consumption: reduce 20mt
- % of renewable energy increase to 10%

ZHENGZHOU, HENAN – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 20% from 2012 level
- Retire 6.7mt of steel capacity and 18mt of coking capacity.
- % of renewable energy increase to 10%

PEACE RIVER DELTA – by 2017
- PM10: Reduce by 10% from 2012 level
- PM2.5: Reduce by 15% from 2012 level
- Coal consumption: cap at 160mt by 2015
- Negative growth in coal consumption

Source: Wikimedia Commons, Chinese Government State Council, Media reports, Bernstein analysis
We believe that coal-fired power generation capacity will fall from ~800GW of installed capacity today to 650GW by the end of the decade as inefficient, small, old power stations are decommissioned. Hydro will increase from ~250GW to 350GW. Gas will go from ~40GW to 150GW. Nuclear will increase from ~13GW to 75GW. Solar and wind will be 200GW and 250GW by the end of the decade, respectively.

Source: CIEC, Bernstein estimates

Source: NBS, CEIC, Bernstein estimates and analysis
Chinese Coal – No Diamonds, Plenty of Rough

Xi-to-Sea Projects – Origin and Destination, Distance, Transport Capacity, Target Completion Date

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Start Date</th>
<th>Project Location</th>
<th>Distance (km)</th>
<th>Completion Year</th>
<th>Additional Coal Rail Capacity (M tons)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mar-10</td>
<td>Handan, Hebei to Changzhi, Shanxi (Expansion)</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov-09</td>
<td>Longkou to Yantai, Shandong</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apr-10</td>
<td>Dezhou to Dajiawa, Shandong</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jun-08</td>
<td>Chifeng, Inner Mongolia to Jinzhou, Liaoning</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>2015E</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar-10</td>
<td>Zhangjiakou to Tangshan (Caofeidian), Hebei</td>
<td>528</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec-09</td>
<td>Lvliang, Shanxi to Rizhao, Shandong</td>
<td>1,260</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aug-10</td>
<td>Jining to Tongliao, Inner Mongolia (Expansion)</td>
<td>923</td>
<td>2014E</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>3,585</td>
<td></td>
<td>764</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Company Reports, Chinese Ministry of Railways, Media Reports, Bernstein Analysis and estimates
Chinese Power – Turn on the Lights, the Party’s Over

- **Low-intensity services sector on the rise.** The GDP share shifts in the last decade have been from agriculture (a moderately energy-intensive activity) to services (a low intensity activity) and manufacturing (a high-intensive activity).

- **Tertiary sector set to gain GDP share.** If primary industry share asymptotes at ~10%, GDP share will shift from secondary industry (high power-intensive activities) to the services sector (low power-intensive activities).

---

**China: GDP Share by Sector: 2000-2013**

- **Agriculture**
- **Industry**
- **Services**

GDP by Sector (%)

- 2000: 10.3%
- 2001:
- 2002:
- 2003:
- 2004:
- 2005:
- 2006:
- 2007:
- 2008:
- 2009:
- 2010:
- 2011:
- 2012:
- 2013:

**Source:** NBS, CEIC, Bernstein analysis

**China: Power Intensity by Sector: 2011**

- **Agriculture**: 0.069
- **Industry**: 0.150
- **Services**: 0.025

Power intensity (KWh per RMB of GDP)

**Source:** NBS, CEIC, Bernstein analysis
From 2016, Chinese coal demand will fall in absolute terms, and that trend will never reverse. There are 5 primary drivers of falling consumption: (i) continuing investment in coal mining and transportation infrastructure; ii) decreasing Chinese power intensity; (iii) increasing power generation capacity from nuclear, gas, hydro and renewables; (iv) falling demand growth for steel, cement and fertilizer and the demise of “inferior” end markets for coal; and (v) the emergence of the environment as a politically sensitive issue in China.

Source: CEIC, Bernstein analysis and estimates
Disclosure Appendix
Disclosure Appendix: Valuation Methodology

- Shenhua, China Coal Energy, Yanzhou: P/FE and P/B multiple on 2015 Earnings/Book Value estimates

- Huaneng, Datang, CR Power: P/FE multiple and P/B multiple. Assume A-shares and H-shares appreciate/depreciate in value by the same %

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Ticker</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Target Price</th>
<th>Recent Price (March 13, 2014)</th>
<th>Average Daily Trading Volume (6 months)</th>
<th>Market Cap (USD B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Coal</td>
<td>China Shenhua</td>
<td>1088.HK</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>HK$15.00</td>
<td>HK$19.36</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>50.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>China Coal Energy</td>
<td>1898.HK</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>HK$2.80</td>
<td>HK$3.77</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>25.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yanzhou Coal</td>
<td>1171.HK</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>HK$4.00</td>
<td>HK$5.01</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ADR:YZC</td>
<td></td>
<td>USD5.16</td>
<td>USD6.35</td>
<td>ADR: 0.23</td>
<td>ADR: 2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Power</td>
<td>Huaneng</td>
<td>902.HK</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>HK$9.00</td>
<td>HK$6.21</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ADR:HNP</td>
<td></td>
<td>USD46.15</td>
<td>USD31.51</td>
<td>ADR: 0.04</td>
<td>ADR: 1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Datang</td>
<td>991.HK</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>HK$3.20</td>
<td>HK$2.85</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CR Power</td>
<td>836.HK</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>HK$20.00</td>
<td>HK$17.88</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The MXAPJ and SPX Indices closed at 458.57 and 1,846.34 respectively on March 13, 2014.
Disclosure Appendix: Risks

There are numerous risks to our investment thesis. In both China and India, our base case forecasts assume continuing rapid economic growth and moderating levels of inflation. Electricity consumption growth in both markets is sensitive to economic growth. In the event that economic conditions deteriorate significantly, this would have a significant negative effect across the group.

In addition, some sector-specific risks are set out below.

**Chinese Coal**

There are numerous risks to our investment thesis on Shenhua, China Coal Energy and Yanzhou. Some of these risks are set out below.

First, contrary to our expectations, electricity demand growth may continue to grow at its historically high rate, increasing demand for thermal coal.

Second, contrary to our expectations, steel growth may accelerate, increasing demand for coking coal.

Third, coal production and rail transportation capacity may not increase at the rate that we are forecasting over the long term. As a result, coal pricing may not decline in the manner that we are anticipating. Further, in the event that rail transportation capacity expansion fails to materialize, movement of coal resources across internally-owned logistics and shipping assets may benefit diversified coal and generation companies like Shenhua.

Fourth, the companies may decide to alter their investment strategies or enter into new business segments, changing capital expenditures or dividend pay-out rates and dividend growth rates.

Fifth, China may relax its coal export quotas and India may become a more significant importer of coal than we are forecasting, providing a source of additional growth for the coal companies that are not currently included within our estimates.

Sixth, the global economy may accelerate, leading to higher than anticipated demand for Chinese manufactured goods, increasing demand for Chinese coal and pushing up the price of seaborne coal.

Seventh, the Chinese government may choose to stimulate the economy, resulting in an increase in demand for steel, power, cement and – ultimately – thermal and coking coal.

**Chinese Power**

There are numerous risks to our investment thesis on Datang, Huaneng and China Resources Power. Some of these risks are set out below.

First, contrary to our expectations, electricity demand growth may continue to grow at its historically high rate, raising utilization rates for all Chinese generation companies.

Second, coal production and rail transportation capacity may not increase at the rate that we are forecasting over the long term. As a result, coal pricing may not decline in the manner that we are anticipating and utilities with coal mining assets may benefit from their internal coal supply to a greater extent than we expect. Further, in the event that rail transportation capacity expansion fails to materialize, movement of coal resources across internally-owned logistics and shipping assets will benefit diversified generation companies.

Third, the companies may decide to alter their investment strategies or enter into new business segments, changing capital expenditures or dividend pay-out rates and dividend growth rates.

Fourth, the tariff process through which the NDRC stipulates the price that power generation plants in China are to receive for electricity generation may be altered. Such changes are difficult to predict. Market-based pricing mechanisms have been discussed and trialed in China on occasion over the last decade. The introduction of such a system would profoundly alter our investment conclusions.

Fifth, given that the electricity generation business in China is highly regulated, changes to regulations – and, in particular, changes to the electricity tariffs - may have a dramatic impact on valuation. Such changes are, almost by definition, difficult to predict but could rapidly improve profitability with little warning.
Disclosure Appendix

SRO REQUIRED DISCLOSURES

References to “Bernstein” relate to Sanford C. Bernstein & Co., LLC, Sanford C. Bernstein Limited, Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited, and Sanford C. Bernstein (business registration number 53193989L), a unit of AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd. which is a licensed entity under the Securities and Futures Act and registered with Company Registration No. 199703364C, collectively.

Bernstein analysts are compensated based on aggregate contributions to the research franchise as measured by account penetration, productivity and proactivity of investment ideas. No analysts are compensated based on performance in, or contributions to, generating investment banking revenues.

Bernstein rates stocks based on forecasts of relative performance for the next 6-12 months versus the S&P 500 for stocks listed on the U.S. and Canadian exchanges, versus the MSCI Pan Europe Index for stocks listed on the European exchanges (except for Russian companies), versus the MSCI Emerging Markets Index for Russian companies and stocks listed on emerging markets exchanges outside of the Asia Pacific region, and versus the MSCI Asia Pacific ex-Japan Index for stocks listed on the Asian (ex-Japan) exchanges - unless otherwise specified. We have three categories of ratings:

- **Outperform**: Stock will outpace the market index by more than 15 pp in the year ahead.
- **Market-Perform**: Stock will perform in line with the market index to within +/-15 pp in the year ahead.
- **Underperform**: Stock will trail the performance of the market index by more than 15 pp in the year ahead.
- **Not Rated**: The stock Rating, Target Price and estimates (if any) have been suspended temporarily.

As of 03/13/2014, Bernstein’s ratings were distributed as follows: Outperform - 43.6% (0.4% banking clients) ; Market-Perform - 45.2% (0.4% banking clients); Underperform - 11.2% (0.0% banking clients); Not Rated - 0.0% (0.0% banking clients). The numbers in parentheses represent the percentage of companies in each category to whom Bernstein provided investment banking services within the last twelve (12) months.

This research publication covers six or more companies. For price chart disclosures, please visit www.bernsteinresearch.com, or you can also write to either: Sanford C. Bernstein & Co. LLC, Director of Compliance, 1345 Avenue of the Americas, New York, N.Y. 10105 or Sanford C. Bernstein Limited, Director of Compliance, 50 Berkeley Street, London W1J 8SB, United Kingdom; or Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited, Director of Compliance, Suites 3206-11, 32/F, One International Finance Centre, 1 Harbour View Street, Central, Hong Kong, or Sanford C. Bernstein (business registration number 53193989L), a unit of AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd. which is a licensed entity under the Securities and Futures Act and registered with Company Registration No. 199703364C, Director of Compliance, 30 Cecil Street, #28-08 Prudential Tower, Singapore 049712.

### 12-Month Rating History as of 03/13/2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ticker</th>
<th>Rating Changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1088.HK</td>
<td>U (RC) 12/14/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1171.HK</td>
<td>U (RC) 12/14/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898.HK</td>
<td>U (RC) 06/13/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>836.HK</td>
<td>M (RC) 03/07/13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>902.HK</td>
<td>O (RC) 09/12/13 M (RC) 03/07/13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>991.HK</td>
<td>M (RC) 03/03/11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rating Guide: O - Outperform, M - Market-Perform, U - Underperform, N - Not Rated

Rating Actions: IC - Initiated Coverage, DC - Dropped Coverage, RC - Rating Change

OTHER DISCLOSURES
OTHER DISCLOSURES

A price movement of a security which may be temporary will not necessarily trigger a recommendation change. Bernstein will advise as and when coverage of securities commences and ceases. Bernstein has no policy or standard as to the frequency of any updates or changes to its coverage policies. Although the definition and application of these methods are based on generally accepted industry practices and models, please note that there is a range of reasonable variations within these models. The application of models typically depends on forecasts of a range of economic variables, which may include, but not limited to, interest rates, exchange rates, earnings, cash flows and risk factors that are subject to uncertainty and also may change over time. Any valuation is dependent upon the subjective opinion of the analysts carrying out this valuation.

This document may not be passed on to any person in the United Kingdom (i) who is a retail client (ii) unless that person or entity qualifies as an authorised person or exempt person within the meaning of section 19 of the UK Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 (the “Act”), or qualifies as a person to whom the financial promotion restriction imposed by the Act does not apply by virtue of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 (Financial Promotion) Order 2005, or is a person classified as an "professional client" for the purposes of the Conduct of Business Rules of the Financial Conduct Authority.

To our readers in the United States: Sanford C. Bernstein & Co., LLC is distributing this publication in the United States and accepts responsibility for its contents. Any U.S. person receiving this publication and wishing to effect securities transactions in any security discussed herein should do so only through Sanford C. Bernstein & Co., LLC.

To our readers in the United Kingdom: This publication has been issued or approved for issue in the United Kingdom by Sanford C. Bernstein Limited, authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and located at 50 Berkeley Street, London W1J 8SB, +44 (0)20-7170-5000.

To our readers in member states of the EEA: This publication is being distributed in the EEA by Sanford C. Bernstein Limited, which is authorised and regulated in the United Kingdom by the Financial Conduct Authority and holds a passport under the Markets in Financial Instruments Directive.

To our readers in Hong Kong: This publication is being distributed in Hong Kong by Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited which is licensed and regulated by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission (Central Entity No. AXC846). This publication is solely for professional investors only, as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance (Cap. 571).

To our readers in Singapore: This publication is being distributed in Singapore by Sanford C. Bernstein, a unit of AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd., only to accredited investors or institutional investors, as defined in the Securities and Futures Act (Chapter 289). Recipients in Singapore should contact AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd. in respect of matters arising from, or in connection with, this publication. AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd. is a licensed entity under the Securities and Futures Act and registered with Company Registration No. 199703384C. It is regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore and located at 30 Cecil Street, #28-08 Prudential Tower, Singapore 049712, +65 62304600. The business name "Sanford C. Bernstein" is registered under business registration number 53193989L.

To our readers in Australia: Sanford C. Bernstein Limited and Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited are exempt from the requirement to hold an Australian financial services licence under the Corporations Act 2001 in respect of the provision of the following financial services to wholesale clients:

- providing financial product advice;
- dealing in a financial product;
- making a market for a financial product; and
- providing a custodial or depository service.

Sanford C. Bernstein Limited and Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited will distribute the requested global research to wholesale clients domiciled within Australia.

Sanford C. Bernstein Limited, Sanford C. Bernstein (Hong Kong) Limited and AllianceBernstein (Singapore) Ltd. are regulated by, respectively, the Financial Conduct Authority under U.K. laws, by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission under Hong Kong laws, and by the Monetary Authority of Singapore under Singapore laws, all of which differ from Australian laws.